

# EXHIBIT A

**OSBORN  
MALEDON**A PROFESSIONAL ASSOCIATION  
ATTORNEYS AT LAWThe Phoenix Plaza  
21st Floor  
2929 North Central Avenue  
Phoenix, Arizona 85012-2794P.O. Box 36379  
Phoenix, Arizona 85067-6379Telephone 602.640.9000  
Facsimile 602.640.9050

1 William J. Maledon, Atty. No. 003670  
 2 Dawn L. Dauphine, Atty. No. 010833  
 3 OSBORN MALEDON, P.A.  
 2929 North Central Avenue, Suite 2100  
 4 Phoenix, Arizona 85012-2794  
 Telephone: (602) 640-9000  
 Facsimile: (602) 640-9050  
wmaledon@omlaw.com  
ddauphine@omlaw.com

6 D. Scott Wise  
 7 Kimberley D. Harris  
 8 DAVIS POLK & WARDWELL  
 450 Lexington Avenue  
 9 New York, New York 10017  
 Telephone: (212) 450-4000  
 Facsimile: (212) 450-3800  
d.wise@dpw.com  
kharris@dpw.com

11 **Attorneys for Defendants AstraZeneca Pharmaceuticals LP and Zeneca Inc.**

12  
 13 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
 14 FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA

16 The State of Arizona *ex. rel.* Terry Goddard, )

17 Plaintiff, )

18 VS. )

19 Abbott Laboratories; Amgen Inc.; Apotthecon, )  
 20 Inc.; AstraZeneca, PLC; AstraZeneca U.S.; )  
 AstraZeneca Pharmaceuticals L.P.; Aventis )  
 21 Pharmaceuticals, Inc.; Aventis Behring )  
 L.L.C.; B. Braun Medical Inc.; Baxter )  
 International Inc.; Baxter Healthcare )  
 22 Corporation; Bayer Corporation; Bedford )  
 Laboratories; Ben Venue Laboratories, Inc.; )  
 23 Boehringer Ingelheim Pharmaceuticals, Inc.; )  
 Biogen Idec U.S.; Bristol-Myers Squibb Co.; )  
 24 Centocor, Inc.; Dey, Inc.; Fujisawa )  
 Healthcare, Inc.; Fujisawa USA, Inc.; Gensia )  
 25 Inc.; Gensia Sicor Pharmaceuticals, Inc.; )  
 Glaxosmithkline, P.L.C.; Glaxowellcome, )  
 26 Inc.; Hoechst Marion Roussel, Inc.; Immunex )

CASE NO. \_\_\_\_\_

**NOTICE OF REMOVAL**

Corporation; Janssen Pharmaceutica )  
 Products, L.P.; Johnson & Johnson; McNeil- )  
 PPC, Inc.; Merck & Co., Inc.; Oncology )  
 Therapeutics Network Corp.; Ortho Biotech; )  
 Pharmacia Corporation; )  
 Pharmacia & Upjohn, Inc.; Rhone-Poulenc )  
 Rorer, S.A.; Roxanne Laboratories, Inc.; )  
 Schering-Plough Corporation; Sicor, Inc.; )  
 Smithkline Beecham Corporation; TAP )  
 Pharmaceutical Products, Inc.; Warrick )  
 Pharmaceuticals Corporation; Watson )  
 Pharmaceuticals, Inc.; Zeneca, Inc. AND )  
 DOES 1 THROUGH 100; DOES 101-125; )  
 DOES 126-150 AN DOES 151-200 )  
 Defendants. )

Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1441 *et seq.*, all Defendants hereby notice removal of  
 this civil action from the Superior Court of the State of Arizona in and for the County  
 of Maricopa, to the United States District Court for the District of Arizona. This  
 Court has removal jurisdiction because this is a civil action “of which the district  
 courts have original jurisdiction” and an action “founded on a claim or right arising  
 under . . . the laws of the United States.” 28 U.S.C. § 1441(a) - (b); *see* 28 U.S.C. §  
 1331. In particular, federal question jurisdiction exists because the State of Arizona’s  
 claim to recover Medicare Part B co-payments raises a substantial federal question in  
 that it requires the resolution of issues of federal law relating to the federal Medicare  
 program. *See Grable & Sons Metal Prods., Inc. v. Darue Engineering &*  
*Manufacturing*, 545 U.S. \_\_\_, 125 S. Ct. 2363 (June 13, 2005); *Franchise Tax Bd. v.*  
*Constr. Laborers Vacation Trust*, 463 U.S. 1, 9, 28 (1983); *cf. State of Montana v.*  
*Abbott Labs., Inc.*, 266 F. Supp. 2d 250, 255-56 (D. Mass. 2003).

In further support of this Notice, Defendants allege:

1. On or about December 6, 2005, the State of Arizona filed the civil  
 action captioned *The State of Arizona ex rel. Terry Goddard v. Abbott Laboratories*,

1 *et al.*, CV2005-018711, in the Superior Court of the State of Arizona in and for the  
2 County of Maricopa.

3 2. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1446(a), attached hereto as Exhibit A is a true  
4 and correct copy of all substantive records and proceedings from the state court.

5 3. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1446(d), Defendants shall file a copy of this  
6 Notice of Removal with the Clerk of the Superior Court of the State of Arizona in and  
7 for the County of Maricopa, and serve Plaintiff and all other parties with this Notice  
8 of Removal promptly after the filing of this Notice.

9 **I. THE STATE OF ARIZONA ACTION**

10 4. This case is virtually identical to numerous cases that have been  
11 transferred from district courts throughout the country and consolidated in a  
12 Multidistrict Litigation (“MDL”) proceeding, *In re Pharmaceutical Industry Average*  
13 *Wholesale Price Litigation*, MDL No. 1456 (the “AWP MDL”), which is currently  
14 pending before the Honorable Patti B. Saris in the United States District Court for the  
15 District of Massachusetts.

16 5. Like this case, many of the cases now pending in the AWP MDL were  
17 originally filed in state courts before removal to federal court and transfer to the AWP  
18 MDL. The AWP MDL currently includes similar actions brought by the States of  
19 Montana, Nevada, Kentucky, Illinois, and New York. Defendants will shortly notify  
20 the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation that this action is closely related to those  
21 pending before Judge Saris in the AWP MDL and thus should be treated as a “tag-  
22 along action” within the meaning of the Rules of the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict  
23 Litigation.

24 6. The two-count Complaint alleges claims against dozens of  
25 pharmaceutical manufacturers. It alleges, in part, that each Defendant pharmaceutical  
26

1 manufacturer caused persons and entities in the State of Arizona, including private  
2 individuals, third-party payors and the Arizona Health Care Cost Containment System  
3 (the "Arizona Medicaid Program"), to overpay for that company's pharmaceutical  
4 products by reporting inflated average wholesale price ("AWP") and other pricing  
5 information, which allegedly serves as a basis for payments by such persons and  
6 entities and reimbursement rates by the Arizona Medicaid Program for prescription  
7 pharmaceuticals. Cmplt. ¶¶ 1-16.

8         7. Although the State of Arizona is the named plaintiff in this action, the  
9 State specifically purports to prosecute this action on behalf of its citizens and  
10 Arizona entities who allegedly have paid inflated prices for prescription  
11 pharmaceuticals covered by Medicare. Cmplt. ¶¶ 9-13. The State alleges that by  
12 reporting allegedly inflated AWP pricing information, Defendants have caused  
13 Medicare Part B beneficiaries in Arizona to make inflated Medicare Part B co-  
14 payments for Defendants' prescription pharmaceuticals, because, until recently,  
15 Medicare co-payments for prescription pharmaceuticals covered under Part B were  
16 based upon published AWP. Cmplt. ¶¶ 9-10, 133-155; *see also* 42 U.S.C. §§  
17 1395l(a), 1395u(o). The State also alleges that by reporting allegedly inflated AWP  
18 pricing information, Defendants have caused overpayment for physician-administered  
19 pharmaceuticals outside of the Medicare Part B context as well as self-administered  
20 pharmaceuticals for which AWP is used as a benchmark. Cmplt. ¶¶ 11-13, 156-174.  
21 The State seeks to recover the amounts allegedly overpaid for increased  
22 pharmaceutical costs, including Medicare Part B co-payments. Cmplt. ¶¶ 18-21.

23         8. The Complaint purports to allege claims under the Unlawful Practices  
24 Section of the Arizona Consumer Fraud Act and provisions of the Arizona  
25 Racketeering Statute. The Plaintiff seeks various legal and equitable remedies.  
26

## II. REMOVAL BASED ON FEDERAL QUESTION JURISDICTION

9. This Court has original jurisdiction over this action under 28 U.S.C. § 1331 because it arises under the laws of the United States. Specifically, federal question jurisdiction exists because the State of Arizona's claim to recover Medicare Part B co-payments on behalf of Arizona Medicare Part B beneficiaries raises a substantial federal question in that it requires the resolution of issues of federal law relating to the federal Medicare program, namely the meaning of AWP in the federal Medicare statute and regulations. *See Grable & Sons Metal Prods., Inc. v. Darue Engineering & Manufacturing*, 545 U.S. \_\_\_\_, 125 S. Ct. 2363, 2368 (June 13, 2005) (removal jurisdiction exists where the meaning of a federal statute is an essential element of a state law claim); *Franchise Tax Bd. v. Constr. Laborers Vacation Trust*, 463 U.S. 1, 9, 28 (1983); *cf State of Montana v. Abbott Labs., Inc.*, 266 F. Supp. 2d 250, 255-56 (D. Mass. 2003).

10. The state law claims asserted by the State relating to Medicare Part B co-payments necessarily depend on an interpretation of the federal statute and regulations governing Medicare Part B reimbursement, which until recently pegged such reimbursement (and the corresponding 20% co-payment) to a pharmaceutical's AWP. Indeed, as Judge Saris has already ruled, a plaintiff in an AWP action cannot recover on its state law claims relating to Medicare Part B co-payments unless it proves its fundamental assertion that the AWP was "inflated" as the term AWP has been interpreted under the federal Medicare reimbursement statute and regulations. *See State of Montana v. Abbott Laboratories, Inc.*, 266 F. Supp. 2d 250, 255-56 (D. Mass. 2003) (holding that an essential element of the State of Minnesota's claims relating to Medicare Part B co-payments "is proof of a discrepancy between the

1 AWP's reported by [defendant] and the meaning of AWP under the Medicare  
2 statute.”).

3 11. This Court has supplemental jurisdiction over Plaintiff's non-federal  
4 claims pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1367.

5 **III. CONSENT TO REMOVAL**

6 12. All Defendants consent to and have joined in this Notice of Removal.

7 13. No Defendant waives any defense to the Complaint, including but not  
8 limited to lack of service, improper service or lack of personal jurisdiction.

9 **IV. REMOVAL IS TIMELY**

10 14. Removal of this case is timely. The Complaint was not served on any  
11 Defendant before December 8, 2005. This Notice of Removal is filed on January 5,  
12 2006, within thirty days of December 8, 2005. *See* 28 U.S.C. § 1446(b).

13 **WHEREFORE**, Defendants notice the removal of this case to the United  
14 States District Court for the District of Arizona pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331 & 1441  
15 *et seq.*

16  
17 **RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED** this 5th day of January, 2006,

18  
19 William J. Maledon  
20 Dawn L. Dauphine  
21 OSBORN MALEDON, P.A.  
22 2929 North Central Avenue  
23 Suite 2100  
24 Phoenix, Arizona 85012

25 **Attorneys for Defendants AstraZeneca Pharmaceuticals LP**  
26 **And Zeneca Inc.<sup>1</sup>**

---

1 The Complaint also names AstraZeneca U.S. and AstraZeneca PLC as separate  
2 defendants. AstraZeneca U.S. does not exist as an entity and has not been served.  
3 AstraZeneca PLC is a public limited holding company organized under the laws of  
4 England and Wales, must be served under the Hague Convention, has not been so

By s/William J. Maledon  
William J. Maledon

**Of Counsel for These Defendants:**

D. Scott Wise  
Kimberley D. Harris  
DAVIS POLK & WARDWELL  
450 Lexington Avenue  
New York, New York 10017  
Telephone: (212) 450-4000  
Facsimile: (212) 450-3800  
[d.wise@dpw.com](mailto:d.wise@dpw.com)  
[kharris@dpw.com](mailto:kharris@dpw.com)

served, and specifically reserves all arguments as to insufficient service. Moreover, in a related case filed in this court, *Swanston v. TAP Pharmaceutical Products, et al.*, Maricopa County Superior Court CV2002-004988, the Court dismissed AstraZeneca PLC for lack of personal jurisdiction. At any rate, all AstraZeneca entities whose consent to removal is required to effectuate removal do consent to removal.



1 Randy Papetti, Atty. No. 014586  
2 LEWIS AND ROCA LLP  
3 40 N. Central Ave, Suite 1900  
4 Phoenix, AZ 85004  
5 602-262-5337  
6 602-734-3865 (fax)  
7 Rpapetti@lrlaw.com

8  
9 **Counsel for Abbott Laboratories and TAP Pharmaceutical  
10 Products Inc.**

11 By s/Randy Papetti  
12 Randy Papetti

13  
14 **Of Counsel for These Defendants:**

15 James R. Daly  
16 J. Ryan Mitchell  
17 JONES DAY  
18 77 W. Wacker Drive  
19 Chicago, IL 60601-1692  
20 312-782-3939  
21 312-782-8585 (fax)  
22 jrdaly@jonesday.com  
23 jrmitchell@jonesday.com

24 Toni-Ann Citera  
25 JONES DAY  
26 222 East 41st Street  
New York, New York 10017-6702  
212-326-3939  
212-755-7306 (fax)  
tcitera@jonesday.com

1 Andrew S. Gordon, Atty. No. 003660  
2 COPPERSMITH GORDON SCHERMER OWENS & NELSON  
3 PLC  
4 2800 North Central Avenue  
5 Suite 1000  
6 Phoenix, AZ 85004  
7 602-224-0999  
8 [andy@cgson.com](mailto:andy@cgson.com)

9  
10 **Attorneys for Defendant Amgen Inc.**

11 By s/Andrew S. Gordon  
12 Andrew S. Gordon

13  
14 **Of Counsel for This Defendant:**

15 Steven F. Barley  
16 Joseph H. Young  
17 HOGAN & HARTSON LLP  
18 111 South Calvert Street  
19 Suite 1600  
20 Baltimore, MD 21202  
21 410-659-2700  
22 [sfbarley@hhlaw.com](mailto:sfbarley@hhlaw.com)  
23 [jhyoung@hhlaw.com](mailto:jhyoung@hhlaw.com)  
24  
25  
26

1 Pamela M. Overton, No. 009062  
2 Aaron Schepler, No. 019985  
3 GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP  
4 2375 East Camelback Road, Suite 700  
5 Phoenix, AZ 85016  
6 (602) 445-8000  
7 [overtonp@gtlaw.com](mailto:overtonp@gtlaw.com)  
8 [Scheplera@gtlaw.com](mailto:Scheplera@gtlaw.com)

**Attorneys for Defendants Aventis Pharmaceuticals Inc.<sup>2</sup>**

9 By s/Pamela M. Overton  
10 Pamela M. Overton

11 **Of Counsel for These Defendants:**

12 Michael L. Koon  
13 Joseph G. Matye  
14 SHOOK, HARDY & BACON  
15 2555 Grand Boulevard  
16 Kansas City, MO 64108-2613  
17 (816) 474-6550  
18 [mkoon@shb.com](mailto:mkoon@shb.com)  
19 [jmatye@shb.com](mailto:jmatye@shb.com)

20  
21  
22  
23  
24 <sup>2</sup> The Complaint also names Rhone-Poulenc Rorer, S.A. and Hoechst Marion  
25 Roussel, Inc. as separate defendants. Rhone-Poulenc Rorer, S.A. and Hoechst Marion  
26 Roussel, Inc. do not exist as separate entities and have not been served. In any event,  
Aventis Pharmaceuticals Inc. and all related entities, whether or not properly named  
or served, consent to removal.

1 Pamela M. Overton, No. 009062  
2 Aaron Schepler, No. 019985  
3 GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP  
4 2375 East Camelback Road, Suite 700  
5 Phoenix, AZ 85016  
6 (602) 445-8000  
7 [overtonp@gtlaw.com](mailto:overtonp@gtlaw.com)  
8 [Scheplera@gtlaw.com](mailto:Scheplera@gtlaw.com)

**Attorneys for Defendant Aventis Behring LLC (now known  
as ZLB Behring LLC)**

By s/Pamela M. Overton  
Pamela M. Overton

**Of Counsel for This Defendant:**

Jonathan T. Rees  
Gregory M. Petouvis  
HOGAN & HARTSON LLP  
555 13<sup>th</sup> Street, N.W.  
Washington, DC 2004  
(202) 637-5600  
[JTRees@hhlaw.com](mailto:JTRees@hhlaw.com)  
[GMPetouvis@hhlaw.com](mailto:GMPetouvis@hhlaw.com)

1 Robert P. Simbro, No. 007501  
2 SIMBRO & WHITE, P.C.  
3 8767 E. Via de Commercio  
4 Suite 103  
5 Scottsdale, Arizona 85258  
6 Telephone: (480) 607-0500  
7 Facsimile: (480) 607-0400  
8 rsimbro@simbrowhiteandbarfield.com

**Attorneys For B. Braun Medical Inc.**

9 By s/Robert P. Simbro  
10 Robert P. Simbro

11 **Of Counsel for This Defendant:**

12 Daniel F. Attridge, P.C.  
13 KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP  
14 655 15th Street, N.W.  
15 Washington, DC 20005  
16 Telephone: (202) 879-5012  
17 Facsimile: (202) 654-9555  
18 dattridge@kirkland.com

Vincent J. Montell, No. 014236  
Karl A. Fazio, No. 018771  
BOWMAN AND BROOKE LLP  
Suite 1600, Phoenix Plaza  
2901 North Central Avenue  
Phoenix, Arizona 85012-2761  
Direct: (602 ) 643-2300  
Fax: (602 ) 248-0947  
Vince.Montell@phx.bowmanandbrooke.com  
Karl.Fazio@phx.bowmanandbrooke.com

**Attorneys for Baxter Healthcare Corporation and Baxter  
International Inc.**

By s/Vincent J. Montell  
Vincent J. Montell

**Of Counsel for These Defendants:**

Merle M. DeLancey  
Tina Ducharme Reynolds  
DICKSTEIN SHAPIRO MORIN & OSHINSKY LLP  
2101 L Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20037  
Direct: (202 ) 785-9700  
Fax: (202 ) 887-0689  
delanceym@dsmo.com  
reynoldst@dsmo.com

1 D. Samuel Coffman, No. 011428  
2 MARISCAL WEEKS McINTYRE & FRIEDLANDER PA  
3 2901 North Central, Suite 200  
4 Phoenix, Arizona 85012  
5 602-285-5000  
6 [sam.coffman@mwmf.com](mailto:sam.coffman@mwmf.com)

**Attorneys for Defendant Bayer Corporation**

7 By s/D. Samuel Coffman  
8 D. Samuel Coffman

9 **Of Counsel for This Defendant:**

10 Richard D. Raskin  
11 Michael P. Doss  
12 SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP  
13 One South Dearborn Street  
14 Chicago, IL 60603  
15 312.853.7000  
16 312.853.7036 (fax)  
17 [rraskin@sidley.com](mailto:rraskin@sidley.com)  
18 [mdoss@sidley.com](mailto:mdoss@sidley.com)  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26

1 John E. DeWulf, No. 006850  
2 Darlene M. Wauro, No. 014697  
3 ROSHKA, DeWULF & PATTEN, PLC  
4 400 East Van Buren  
5 Suite 800  
6 Phoenix, Arizona 85004  
7 602-256-6100  
8 [dewulf@rdp-law.com](mailto:dewulf@rdp-law.com)  
9 [wauro@rdp-law.com](mailto:wauro@rdp-law.com)

10 Helen E. Witt  
11 Maria Pellegrino Rivera, No. 018124  
12 KIRKLAND & ELLIS, LLP  
13 200 East Randolph Drive  
14 Chicago, Illinois 60601-3363  
15 312-861-2000  
16 [hwitt@Kirkland.com](mailto:hwitt@Kirkland.com)  
17 [mriviera@Kirkland.com](mailto:mriviera@Kirkland.com)

18 **Attorneys for Defendants Ben Venue Laboratories, Inc.,**  
19 **Boehringer Ingelheim Pharmaceuticals, Inc., and Roxane**  
20 **Laboratories, Inc.<sup>3</sup>**

21 By s/John E. DeWulf  
22 John E. DeWulf

23  
24 <sup>3</sup> The Complaint also names Bedford Laboratories as a separate defendant.  
25 Bedford Laboratories is not a separate entity and has not been served. Rather,  
26 Bedford Laboratories is a division of Ben Venue Laboratories, Inc., which has also  
been named as a defendant. In any event, all Boehringer-related entities, whether or  
not properly named or served, consent to removal.



1 Andrew M. Jacobs, No. 021146  
2 Adrienne S. Ehrhardt, No. 022429  
3 SNELL & WILMER L.L.P.  
4 One South Church Avenue  
5 Suite 1500  
6 Tucson, Arizona 85701  
7 520-882-1200  
8 FAX: 520-884-1294  
9 [ajacobs@swlaw.com](mailto:ajacobs@swlaw.com)  
10 [aehrhardt@swlaw.com](mailto:aehrhardt@swlaw.com)

11 **Attorneys for Defendant Biogen Idec, Inc. (incorrectly named**  
12 **as Biogen IDEC U.S.)**

13 By s/Andrew M. Jacobs  
14 Andrew M. Jacobs

15 **Of Counsel for this Defendant:**

16 James C. Burling  
17 Maura T. Healey  
18 Kimberly I. Friday  
19 WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP  
20 60 State Street  
21 Boston, MA 02109  
22 Telephone: (617) 526-6000  
23 Facsimile: (617) 526-5000  
24 [james.burling@wilmerhale.com](mailto:james.burling@wilmerhale.com)  
25 [maura.healey@wilmerhale.com](mailto:maura.healey@wilmerhale.com)  
26 [kim.friday@wilmerhale.com](mailto:kim.friday@wilmerhale.com)

1 George Brandon, Arizona Bar No. 017947  
2 Andrea L. Marconi, Arizona Bar No. 022577  
3 SQUIRE, SANDERS & DEMPSEY L.L.P.  
4 Two Renaissance Square  
5 40 North Central Avenue, Suite 2700  
6 Phoenix, AZ 85004-4498  
7 Telephone: 602.528.4000  
8 Facsimile: 602.253.8129  
9 gbrandon@ssd.com  
10 amarconi@ssd.com

11 **Attorneys for Defendants Apothecon, Inc., Bristol-Myers**  
12 **Squibb Co., and Oncology Therapeutics Network Corp.**

13 By s/George Brandon  
14 George Brandon

15 **Of Counsel for These Defendants:**

16 Steven M. Edwards  
17 Lyndon M. Tretter  
18 HOGAN & HARTSON L.L.P.  
19 875 Third Avenue  
20 New York, NY 10022  
21 Telephone: 212.918.3000  
22 Facsimile: 212.918.3100  
23 SMEdwards@HHLAW.com  
24 LMTretter@HHLAW.com  
25  
26

1 Don Bivens, No. 005134  
2 Paul L. Stoller, No. 016773  
3 BIVENS & NORE, P.A.  
4 3003 N. Central Avenue, #1200  
5 Phoenix, AZ 85012  
6 (602) 604-2200  
7 [dwbivens@bivens-nore.com](mailto:dwbivens@bivens-nore.com)  
8 [plstoller@bivens-nore.com](mailto:plstoller@bivens-nore.com)

**Attorneys for Defendant Dey, Inc.**

9 By s/Don Bivens  
10 Don Bivens

11 **Of Counsel for This Defendant:**

12 Christopher C. Palermo  
13 KELLEY DRYE & WARREN LLP  
14 101 Park Avenue  
15 New York, N.Y. 10178  
16 (212) 808-7789  
17 [cpalermo@kelleydrye.com](mailto:cpalermo@kelleydrye.com)  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26

1 Martin A. Aronson, Arizona Bar No. 9005  
2 MORRILL & ARONSON, P.L.C.  
3 One East Camelback Road, Suite 340  
4 Phoenix, Arizona 85012  
5 Telephone: (602) 263-8993  
6 Facsimile: (602) 285-9544  
7 maronson@maazlaw.com

8 **Attorneys for Defendants Fujisawa Healthcare, Inc.**  
9 **and Fujisawa USA, Inc.**

10 By s/Martin Aronson  
11 Martin Aronson

12 **Of Counsel for These Defendants:**

13 Michael T. Scott, Esq.  
14 REED SMITH LLP  
15 2500 One Liberty Place  
16 1650 Market Street  
17 Philadelphia, PA 19103-7301  
18 Telephone: (215) 851-8100  
19 Facsimile: (215) 851-1420  
20 MScott@reedsmith.com

21 Andrew L. Hurst, Esq.  
22 Lasagne A. Wilhite, Esq.  
23 REED SMITH LLP  
24 1301 K Street, N.W.  
25 Suite 1100 - East Tower  
26 Washington, D.C. 20005  
Telephone: (202) 414-9200  
Facsimile: (202) 414-9299  
AHurst@reedsmith.com  
LWilhite@reedsmith.com

1 Michael K. Kennedy, No. 004224  
2 GALLAGHER & KENNEDY P.A.  
3 2575 E. Camelback Road, Suite 1100  
4 Phoenix, AZ 85016  
5 Telephone: (602) 530-8000  
6 Facsimile: (602) 530-8500  
7 mkk@gknet.com

8  
9 **Attorneys for Defendant Immunex Corporation**

10 By s/Michael K. Kennedy  
11 Michael K. Kennedy

12  
13 **Of Counsel for This Defendant:**

14 David J. Burman  
15 Kathleen M. O'Sullivan  
16 PERKINS COIE LLP  
17 1201 Third Avenue, Suite 4800  
18 Seattle, WA 98101-3099  
19 Telephone: (206) 359-8000  
20 Facsimile: (206) 359-9000  
21 DBurman@perkinscoie.com  
22 KOSullivan@perkinscoie.com  
23  
24  
25  
26

1 Mary G. Pryor, No. 016709  
2 THE CAVANAGH LAW FIRM, P.A.  
3 1850 North Central Avenue, Suite 2400  
4 Phoenix, Arizona 85004-4527  
5 (602) 322-4035  
6 [mpryor@cavanaghlaw.com](mailto:mpryor@cavanaghlaw.com)

**Attorneys for Defendants Centocor, Inc., Janssen  
Pharmaceutica LLP, Johnson & Johnson, McNeil PPC, and  
Ortho Biotech Products LLP**

By s/Mary G. Pryor  
Mary Pryor

**Of Counsel for These Defendants:**

William F. Cavanaugh, Jr.  
Andrew D. Schau  
PATTERSON, BELKNAP, WEBB & TYLER LLP  
1133 Avenue of the Americas  
New York, NY 10036-6710  
(212) 336-2000  
[adschau@pbwt.com](mailto:adschau@pbwt.com)

1 John R. Dacey, Esq., Arizona State Bar No. 004962  
2 James A. Craft, Esq., Arizona State Bar No. 005145  
3 GAMMAGE & BURNHAM  
4 Two North Central Avenue, 18th Floor  
5 Phoenix, AZ 85004  
6 Telephone (602) 256-0566  
7 Facsimile (602) 256-4475  
8 Jdacey@gblaw.com  
9 jcrafft@gblaw.com

10 **Attorneys For Defendant Merck & Co., Inc.**

11 By s/John R. Dacey  
12 John R. Dacey

13 **Of Counsel for This Defendant:**

14 John M. Townsend, Esq.  
15 Robert P. Reznick, Esq.  
16 Robert B. Funkhouser, Esq.  
17 HUGHES HUBBARD & REED LLP  
18 1775 I Street, N.W.  
19 Washington, DC 20006-2401  
20 Telephone: (202) 721-4600  
21 Facsimile: (202) 721-4646  
22 townsend@hugheshubbard.com  
23 reznick@hugheshubbard.com  
24 funkhous@hugheshubbard.com

1 Barry D. Halpern, No. 005441  
2 Stephanie V. Hackett, No. 019353  
3 Joseph G. Adams, No. 018210  
4 SNELL & WILMER L.L.P.  
5 One Arizona Center  
6 400 E. Van Buren  
7 Phoenix, AZ 85004-2204  
8 (602) 382-6000  
9 FAX: (602) 382-6070  
10 [bhalpern@swlaw.com](mailto:bhalpern@swlaw.com)  
11 [shackett@swlaw.com](mailto:shackett@swlaw.com)  
12 [jgadams@swlaw.com](mailto:jgadams@swlaw.com)

13 **Attorneys for Defendants Pharmacia Corporation and**  
14 **Pharmacia & Upjohn, Inc.**

15 By s/Stephanie V. Hackett  
16 Stephanie V. Hackett

17 **Of Counsel for These Defendants:**

18 John C. Dodds  
19 MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP  
20 1701 Market Street  
21 Philadelphia, PA 19103-2921  
22 Telephone: 215.963.5000  
23 Facsimile: 215.963.5001  
24 [jdodds@morganlewis.com](mailto:jdodds@morganlewis.com)

25 Scott A. Stempel  
26 J. Clayton Everett, Jr.  
MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP  
1111 Pennsylvania Ave., NW  
Washington, DC 20004  
Telephone: 202.739.3000  
Facsimile: 202.739.3001  
[sstempel@morganlewis.com](mailto:sstempel@morganlewis.com)  
[jeverett@morganlewis.com](mailto:jeverett@morganlewis.com)



1 Lydia A. Jones, No. 017178  
2 ROGERS & THEOBALD, LLP  
3 The Camelback Esplanade  
4 8th Floor  
5 2425 East Camelback Road  
6 Phoenix, Arizona 85016  
7 Tel: (602) 852-5582  
8 Fax: (602) 852-5570  
9 [laj@rogerstheobald.com](mailto:laj@rogerstheobald.com)

6 **Attorneys for Defendants Sicor Inc. f/d/b/a Gensia, Inc.,**  
7 **Gensia Sicor Pharmaceuticals Inc.**

8 By s/Lydia A. Jones  
9 Lydia A. Jones

10 **Of Counsel for these Defendants:**

11 Elizabeth I. Hack, Esq.  
12 SONNENSCHN NATH & ROSENTHAL LLP  
13 1301 K Street, NW, Suite 600 East Tower  
14 Washington, DC 20005  
15 Tel: (202) 408-9236  
16 Fax: (202) 408-6399  
17 [ehack@sonnenschein.com](mailto:ehack@sonnenschein.com)

1 Robert W. Shely, No. 014261  
2 Rodney W. Ott, No. 016686  
3 BRYAN CAVE LLP  
4 Two North Central Avenue, Suite 2200  
5 Phoenix, Arizona 85254  
6 Tel: 602-364-7000  
7 Fax: 602-364-7070  
8 [rwshely@bryancave.com](mailto:rwshely@bryancave.com)  
9 [rwott@bryancave.com](mailto:rwott@bryancave.com)

10 **Attorneys for SmithKline Beecham Corporation d/b/a**  
11 **GlaxoSmithKline<sup>4</sup>**

12 By s/Rodney W. Ott  
13 Rodney W. Ott  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19

20 <sup>4</sup> The Complaint names GlaxoSmithKline plc, Glaxo Wellcome, Inc. and  
21 SmithKline Beecham Corp. as separate defendants. Glaxo Wellcome, Inc. and  
22 SmithKline Beecham Corp. have merged. In the United States, "SmithKline  
23 Beecham Corporation" is the remaining corporation, and it is doing business as  
24 "GlaxoSmithKline." Thus, the defendants named as Glaxo Wellcome, Inc. and  
25 SmithKline Beecham Corp. are both appearing under the correct corporate name of  
26 SmithKline Beecham Corporation, d/b/a GSK. Named defendant GlaxoSmithKline  
plc is a holding company with no employees organized under the laws of England and  
Wales. GlaxoSmithKline plc was not involved in the matters raised by the  
Complaint, can only be properly served under the Hague Convention, has not been  
served, and specifically reserves all arguments as to insufficient service. At any rate,  
GSK and all related entities, whether or not properly named or served, consent to  
removal.

1 Andrew F. Halaby, No.017251  
2 Adam E. Lang, No. 022545  
3 SNELL & WILMER  
4 One Arizona Center  
5 Phoenix, Arizona 85004-2202  
6 Telephone (602) 382-6000  
7 Facsimile (602) 382-6070  
8 [ahalaby@swlaw.com](mailto:ahalaby@swlaw.com)  
9 [alang@swlaw.com](mailto:alang@swlaw.com)

10 **Attorneys for Defendants Warrick Pharmaceuticals**  
11 **Corporation and Schering-Plough Corporation**

12 By s/Andrew F. Halaby  
13 Andrew F. Halaby

14 **Of Counsel for These Defendants:**

15 John T. Montgomery  
16 Brien T. O'Connor  
17 ROPES & GRAY LLP  
18 One International Place  
19 Boston, MA 02110-2624  
20 Telephone (617) 951-7000  
21 Facsimile (617) 951-7050  
22 [john.montgomery@ropesgray.com](mailto:john.montgomery@ropesgray.com)  
23 [brien.o'connor@ropesgray.com](mailto:brien.o'connor@ropesgray.com)

24 J. Steven Baughman  
25 ROPES & GRAY LLP  
26 One Metro Center  
700 12<sup>th</sup> Street, N.W., Suite 900  
Washington, DC 20005-3948  
Telephone (202) 508-4600  
Facsimile (202) 508-4650  
[steven.baughman@ropesgray.com](mailto:steven.baughman@ropesgray.com)

1 Winn L. Sammons, No. 005500  
2 SANDERS & PARKS, P.C.  
3 3030 N. 3rd Street, Suite 1300  
4 Phoenix, AZ 85012  
5 (602) 532-5786  
6 Winn.Sammons@SandersParks.com

**Attorneys for Watson Pharmaceuticals, Inc.**

7 By s/Winn L. Sammons  
8 Winn L. Sammons

9 **Of Counsel for this Defendant:**

10 Douglas B. Farquhar  
11 Michelle L. Butler  
12 HYMAN, PHELPS, & McNAMARA, P.C.  
13 700 Thirteenth Street, N.W., Suite 1200  
14 Washington, D.C. 20005  
15 (202) 737-5600  
16 (202) 737-9329 (facsimile)  
17 dbf@hpm.com  
18 mlb@hpm.com  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on January 5, 2006, I electronically transmitted the attached document to the Clerk's Office using the CM/ECF System for filing and transmittal of a Notice of Electronic Filing:

I hereby certify that on January 5, 2006, I served the attached document (**minus Exhibit A - which consists of the documents previously filed in Superior Court**) by mail on the following:

Terry Goddard  
Attorney General  
Ann Thompson Uglietta  
Assistant Attorney General  
Consumer Protection and Advocacy Section  
1275 West Washington  
Phoenix, Arizona 85007-2997

Steve W. Berman  
Robert B. Carey  
Sean R. Matt  
Hagens Berman Sobol Shapiro LLP  
1301 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2900  
Seattle, Washington 98101

**Attorneys for Plaintiff**

s/Deborah B. Dunn